

## Message Text

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 USNATO 04172 01 OF 02 241555Z  
ACTION EUR-12

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 ACDA-12 CEQ-01 CIAE-00 DOTE-00  
EPA-04 HEW-06 HUD-02 INR-10 INT-05 L-03 NSAE-00  
NSC-05 NSF-02 OIC-02 PA-02 PM-05 SOE-02 DOE-15  
OES-07 SP-02 SS-15 TRSE-00 ICA-20 DODE-00 EB-08  
COME-00 /141 W

-----040607 241624Z /43

R 241546Z APR 78  
FM USMISSION USNATO  
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 0988  
INFO AMEMBASSY OSLO

UNCLAS SECTION 01 OF 02 USNATO 04172

DEPARTMENT PLEASE PASS EPA FOR WARD AND PRINCIOTTA

E.O.11652: N/A  
TAGS: CCMS, ENRG, SENV  
SUBJECT: CCMS: FLUE GAS DESULFURIZATION PILOT STUDY

SUMMARY: AT APRIL 19-21, 1978 FLUE GAS DESULFURIZATION(FGD)  
PILOT STUDY MEETING IN OSLO, U.S. PILOT LEADER PRINCIOTTA  
SKILLFULLY LEAD EXPERTS THROUGH FINAL REVIEW OF TASK I OF  
THE STUDY, THE STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS, AND INITIAL DIS-  
CUSSION OF TASK II OF THE PILOT STUDY, THE FGD PROCESS  
APPLICABILITY REPORT. EXPERTS WILL MEET AGAIN IN LATE  
OCTOBER. END SUMMARY.

1. FOLLOWING EXPERTS PARTICIPATED IN APRIL 19-21 FLUE GAS  
DESULFURIZATION MEETING IN OSLO, NORWAY:

CANADA: BAMBROUGH  
DENMARK: COLLIANDER  
FRG: DAVIDS, WEISSER, REIMANN  
THE NETHERLANDS: BOSMA, VAN DER BUCHEN  
NORWAY: KOLDRUP, ERGA, GAUPSET , TOKERUD  
UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 USNATO 04172 01 OF 02 241555Z

UK: DEARNLEY, TUNNICLIFFE, NICHOLSON, LITTLER  
US: PRINCIOTTA, GERSTLE, TORSTRICK, SCHINDLER  
SWEDEN: ASSARSON

2. AS FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS, EXPERTS REVIEWED IN DETAIL  
FINAL DRAFT OF FGD STATE-OF-THE-ART SURVEY, WHICH WILL BE  
REVISED TO REFLECT COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS THAT WERE MADE.

EXPERTS ALSO REVIEWED DRAFT OF TASK I SUMMARY WHICH WILL BE PUBLISHED SIMULTANEOUSLY WITH DETAILED REPORTS. AS RESULT OF DISCUSSION OF SUMMARY, IT WILL BE CONSIDERABLY SHORTENED. UK EXPERT (BETTELHEIM) AGREED TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE SUMMARY BY DRAFTING WITHIN SEVERAL WEEKS A SECTION ON CURRENT PROBLEM AREAS OF THE VARIOUS FGD PROCESSES. PILOT LEADER INTENDS TO MAIL REVISED SUMMARY TO EXPERTS IN JUNE AND SEEK THEIR APPROVAL BY MAIL. STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS AND SUMMARY SHOULD BE PUBLISHED BEFORE OCTOBER 1978, AND THUS COMPLETE TASK I OF THE PILOT STUDY.

3. AT THE OSLO MEETING, THE EXPERTS BEGAN WORK ON TASK II ("APPLICABILITY STUDY") WHICH WILL ATTEMPT TO INDICATE COSTS, BENEFITS, DIFFERENCES, AND SPECIAL CHARACTERISTICS OF THE VARIOUS FGD PROCESSES. PARTICIPANTS SUGGESTED THAT THE FOLLOWING ELEMENTS MIGHT BE SUITABLE FOR INCLUSION IN THE APPLICABILITY REPORT:

--DECISION-TREE ANALYSIS TO ASSIST IN SELECTING CANDIDATE PROCESSES

--COMPARATIVE ECONOMIC ANALYSIS FOR SELECTED APPLICATION

--MATERIAL AND ENERGY BALANCE INFORMATION

--OUTLINE OF EVALUATION SELECTION FACTORS (E.G.GERMAN UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 USNATO 04172 01 OF 02 241555Z

APPLICABILITY GRAPH)

--BIBLIOGRAPHY ON PROCESSES

--LIST OF MODEL PLANTS FOR EACH FGD PROCESS

4. PARTICIPANTS IN MEETING ALSO SUGGESTED THAT USERS OF STUDY MIGHT INCLUDE, INTER ALIOS:

--DECISION-MAKERS IN COUNTRIES CONSIDERING SULFUR DIOXIDE CONTROL POLICY

--ENFORCEMENT OFFICIALS NEGOTIATING WITH UTILITIES FOR FGD FACILITIES

--UTILITY OFFICIALS DEBATING WHICH SCRUBBERS TO USE FOR ONE OR MORE FACILITIES

--VENDORS SEEKING COMPARATIVE COSTS AND PERFORMANCE INFORMATION

--ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS

--ACADEMICIANS

5. DURING DISCUSSION U.S. CIRCULATED:

--EXAMPLE "DECISION TREE" FOR SELECTING FGD SYSTEMS

-- AN APPLICABILITY DECISION CHART

-- PAPER OUTLINING GENERAL PREMISES AND ASSUMPTIONS FOR  
MAKING ECONOMIC EVALUATION OF VARIOUS PROCESSES.

6. GERMAN EXPERTS WELCOMED INITIATION OF TASK II AND VERY

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 USNATO 04172 02 OF 02 241559Z

ACTION EUR-12

INFO OCT-01 ISO-00 ACDA-12 CEQ-01 CIAE-00 DOTE-00

EPA-04 HEW-06 HUD-02 INR-10 INT-05 L-03 NSAE-00

NSC-05 NSF-02 OIC-02 PA-02 PM-05 SOE-02 DOE-15

OES-07 SP-02 SS-15 TRSE-00 ICA-20 DODE-00 EB-08

COME-00 /141 W

-----040634 241624Z /45

R 241546Z APR 78

FM USMISSION USNATO

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 0989

INFO AMEMBASSY OSLO

UNCLAS SECTION 02 OF 02 USNATO 04172

HELPFULLY CIRCULATED THEIR OWN PROCESS APPLICABILITY  
DECISION GRAPH WHICH COMPLEMENTED U.S. CHART BUT ADDED  
WEIGHTING FACTORS TO ALLOW DECISION-MAKER TO STRESS THOSE  
CHARACTERISTICS HE PARTICULARLY DESIRED. DECISION TREE  
AND CHARTS WILL BE REVISED TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT EXPERTS'  
COMMENTS. PARTICIPANTS ALSO AGREED ON SET OF PREMISES AND  
ASSUMPTIONS THAT WILL ALLOW U.S. EXPERTS TO BEGIN DRAFTING  
FGD ECONOMIC EVALUATION STUDY.

7. AT CONCLUSION OF DISCUSSION U.K. EXPERTS SAID THEY WERE  
UNSURE WHETHER PARTICIPANTS HAD SUFFICIENTLY DEFINED SCOPE  
AND TARGET AUDIENCE OF TASK II. TO ASSIST EXPERTS IN THIS  
REGARD, PILOT LEADER PLANS TO CIRCULATE TO THEM BY END OF  
MAY MORE DETAILED WORK AND GOAL PLAN FOR TASK II. ONCE  
COMMENTS ARE RECEIVED, U.S. EXPERTS WILL DRAFT VARIOUS  
SECTIONS OF THE APPLICABILITY REPORT AND CIRCULATE THEM

ABOUT SIX WEEKS BEFORE NEXT MEETING SO THAT EXPERTS CAN PREPARE TO DISCUSS THEM. COMMENT: OUTSIDE FORMAL SESSIONS U.K. PARTICIPANTS SAID THEY BELIEVED STUDY WAS PROCEEDING WELL, BUT THAT THEY WOULD PROBABLY OFFER EXTENSIVE COMMENTS ON TASK II DRAFTS. END COMMENT.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 USNATO 04172 02 OF 02 241559Z

8. AS RESULT OF APRIL 19-21 MEETING, FUTURE WORK PROGRAM OF FGD PILOT STUDY IS TENTATIVELY THE FOLLOWING:

1978:

--APRIL/MAY - REVISE STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS AND PREPARE THEM FOR PUBLICATION

--EARLY MAY - U.K. CONTRIBUTION TO SUMMARY OF STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS

LATE MAY - PILOT LEADER CIRCULATES WORK AND GOAL PLAN FOR TASK II TO EXPERTS FOR COMMENT

--JUNE - CIRCULATE DRAFT OF SUMMARY OF STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS FOR EXPERTS' COMMENTS AND APPROVAL

--SUMMER - U.S. PREPARES DRAFTS FOR TASK II (APPLICABILITY REPORT)

--FALL - PUBLISH STATE-OF-THE-ART REPORTS AND SUMMARY

--WEEK OF OCTOBER 30 - EXPERTS MEETING IN THE NETHERLANDS TO REVIEW TASK II DRAFTS AND BEGIN CONSIDERATION OF FINAL REPORT.

1979:

--MARCH - EXPERTS MEETING IN USA TO MAKE FINAL REVIEW OF TASK II REPORTS AND REVIEW DRAFT OF FINAL REPORT

--OCTOBER - FINAL REPORT TO CCMS PLENARY. BENNETT

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

## Message Attributes

**Automatic Decaptioning:** X  
**Capture Date:** 01 jan 1994  
**Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Current Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Concepts:** ALLIANCE, COMMITTEE MEETINGS, GASES, MEETING REPORTS  
**Control Number:** n/a  
**Copy:** SINGLE  
**Draft Date:** 24 apr 1978  
**Decaption Date:** 01 jan 1960  
**Decaption Note:**  
**Disposition Action:** n/a  
**Disposition Approved on Date:**  
**Disposition Case Number:** n/a  
**Disposition Comment:**  
**Disposition Date:** 01 jan 1960  
**Disposition Event:**  
**Disposition History:** n/a  
**Disposition Reason:**  
**Disposition Remarks:**  
**Document Number:** 1978USNATO04172  
**Document Source:** CORE  
**Document Unique ID:** 00  
**Drafter:** n/a  
**Enclosure:** n/a  
**Executive Order:** N/A  
**Errors:** N/A  
**Expiration:**  
**Film Number:** D780174-0927  
**Format:** TEL  
**From:** USNATO  
**Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Image Path:**  
**ISecure:** 1  
**Legacy Key:** link1978/newtext/t19780422/aaaaaspz.tel  
**Line Count:** 212  
**Litigation Code IDs:**  
**Litigation Codes:**  
**Litigation History:**  
**Locator:** TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM  
**Message ID:** bb1d49a8-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc  
**Office:** ACTION EUR  
**Original Classification:** UNCLASSIFIED  
**Original Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Original Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Original Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Page Count:** 4  
**Previous Channel Indicators:** n/a  
**Previous Classification:** n/a  
**Previous Handling Restrictions:** n/a  
**Reference:** n/a  
**Retention:** 0  
**Review Action:** RELEASED, APPROVED  
**Review Content Flags:**  
**Review Date:** 29 mar 2005  
**Review Event:**  
**Review Exemptions:** n/a  
**Review Media Identifier:**  
**Review Release Date:** N/A  
**Review Release Event:** n/a  
**Review Transfer Date:**  
**Review Withdrawn Fields:** n/a  
**SAS ID:** 2865592  
**Secure:** OPEN  
**Status:** NATIVE  
**Subject:** CCMS: FLUE GAS DESULFURIZATION PILOT STUDY SUMMARY: AT APRIL 19-21, 1978 FLUE GAS DESULFURIZATION(FGD) PILOT STUDY MEETING IN OSLO, U.S. PILOT LEADE R PRI  
**TAGS:** ENRG, SENV, CCMS  
**To:** STATE  
**Type:** TE  
**vdkgvkey:** odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS\_Docs/bb1d49a8-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc  
**Review Markings:**  
Sheryl P. Walter  
Declassified/Released  
US Department of State  
EO Systematic Review  
20 Mar 2014  
**Markings:** Sheryl P. Walter Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 20 Mar 2014